

STATE OF ARIZONA LIVESTOCK LOSS BOARD

5000 W. Carefree Highway Phoenix, Arizona 85086-5000 (623) 236-7281 www.azgovernor.gov GOVERNOR Douglas A. Ducey

BOARD MEMBERS

Larry D. Voyles - Chair Stephen Clark Sarahmarge Crigler Mark W. Killian Jim F. O'Haco Clay Parsons Dr. George Ruyle James H. Unmacht II Ken Van De Graaff

November 3, 2016

Honorable Mark Brnovich Arizona Attorney General 1275 West Washington Phoenix, AZ 85007

RE: Livestock Loss Board Request for Formal Legal Opinion

Fifth Amendment Takings Clause Issue

Dear General Brnovich,

The Arizona Livestock Loss Board was established by the Legislature in its 2015 regular session for the purpose of addressing the economic loss from the depredation of wolves on livestock operations. The Board has been meeting to establish protocols and has begun the planning process that will allow us to begin distributing available funds to our constituents who have suffered depredations to their livestock.

The goal of the Board is to focus on our statutory mission of providing funding and support to these constituents. However, some members of the Board have expressed a strongly held concern with the broader issue of the Fifth Amendment Takings Clause as it relates to livestock depredations from wolves reintroduced into Arizona by the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service.

Generally, when a government takes private property for public use the government must pay "just compensation" to the property's former owners. Many types of government action infringe on private property rights. The government must compensate not only when it seizes private property, but also for government regulations that cause economic loss.

Members of the Board believe strongly that this is a major area of concern for Arizona's stockmen (and women), as well as for all Arizonans. Based on this concern, The Livestock Loss Board is asking that the Attorney General's Office provide a formal legal opinion with regard to the question whether the federal government is liable for compensation under the Fifth Amendment when a Mexican wolf released into the wild kills livestock.

Honorable Mark Brnovich November 3, 2016 2

We would be happy to meet with you and your staff at any time to discuss this in more depth. I also thank you for the work you do to protect Arizona's authorities and look forward to working with you.

Sincerely,

Larry D. Voyles

Chairman