

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING
Arizona Livestock Loss Board
Arizona Game and Fish Department
5000 W. Carefree Highway
Phoenix, AZ 85086

PRESENT: (Board Members)

Stephen Clark
Mark Killian (via telephone)
Larry D. Voyles, Chairman
Jim O'Haco
Ken Van de Graaff
Dr. George Ruyle (via telephone)
James Unmacht
Sarahmarge Crigler (via telephone)

Thursday November 3, 2016

(Staff)
Kevin Kinsall
Kent Komadina
Barbara Cook

1. Welcome

Chairman Voyles called the meeting to order at **2:30 p.m.** This meeting followed an agenda dated October 25, 2016.

2. Roll Call

Mr. Kinsall led the roll call and noted attendance of the Board members. Board members present were: Stephen Clark from Glendale, representing Wildlife Conservation & Knowledge of Livestock; Larry Voyles from Phoenix, Director of AZ Game and Fish Department; Jim F. O'Haco from Winslow, representing Livestock Industry; and Ken Van de Graaff from Gilbert, representing Livestock Industry. Board members present via telephone were: Dr. George Ruyle from Tucson, representing Faculty Member at University; Mark Killian from Phoenix, Director of AZ Department of Agriculture; and Sarahmarge Crigler from Springerville, representing Livestock Industry; James Unmacht from New River, representing Wildlife Conservation & Knowledge of Livestock. Not present for this meeting were: Clay Parsons from Marana, representing Livestock Auction Market Owner.

3. Review and approve minutes of August 3, 2016 meeting

The members individually reviewed the drafted minutes.

MOTION: APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE AUGUST 3, 2016 MEETING AS WRITTEN. Ken de Graaff moved and Jim O'Haco seconded.

VOTE: Unanimous

4. Review Agenda

Chairman Voyles reviewed the meeting's agenda. There were no questions on the agenda items.

5. Call to the Public

Chairman Voyles invited any public attendees who wanted to be heard to present their Blue Speaker Cards. There were two Blue Speaker Cards which reference Item No. 6. They can also speak again when agenda Item No. 6 is discussed.

The first Blue Speaker Card is from Patrick Bray, representing the Arizona Cattleman's Association. They are in support of Item No. 6 Wolf Depredation Interim Policy. They worked hard with the Department in drafting the original legislation and would like to ask the Department to hold the \$80,000 from the federal funds received and not pass it along to the coexistents council in Albuquerque because they feel that our Arizona Game and Fish knows better on how to distribute those funds than the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. We realize there are some discussion about broader topics that need to be addressed in the larger rule-making package. Livestock depredation is occurring on the landscape today and individuals should be reimbursed for those losses from this program. The Department has created some great policy that will guide us through the next year and get those individuals paid.

The second Blue Speaker Card is from Cary Dobson from Vernon AZ. He has come to the meeting today to ask for some help. He has had 13 confirmed kills this year. He has received 6 payments so far and still waiting on 7. First kill was in February and the last in September. He has moved his cattle from pasture to pasture and even down here to the Valley to get them off the mountain to keep them away from the

wolves. He needs some help and hopes that the money stays here and not with the council.

6. Staff Presentation / Discussion

The Board reviewed and discussed the Wolf Depredation Interim Policy.

Questions: Dr. George Ruyle asked about edits from the last meeting minutes on two proposed changes: 1) add commercial and registered cattle; 2) not to exceed market value. What was the status of those edits? Kevin Kinsall: Because this is the Interim Policy, we are keeping it as streamlined as possible. They will be addressed in the General Rule package. Mark Killian: Would like to know the cost for Cary Dobson to move his cattle to the Valley and will he apply for reimbursement? Cary Dobson: The Department helped by giving him \$3,000 this year. It cost \$24,000 which was just for the trucking, not counting for the hay and watering on State leases. The wolves are coming right down on his property and he has confirmed kills. Kevin Kinsall: He can apply under our other grant. We have two grants: one covers actual depredations; the other covers cost avoidance. This could be covered under the second grant of cost avoidance once we have the rules in place.

MOTION: To approve Wolf Depredation Interim Policy. Jim O'Haco moved and Mark Killian seconded.

VOTE: Unanimous

7. Staff Presentation / Discussion

The Board reviewed and discussed to approve letter to the Arizona Congressional Delegation requesting funds to address the depredation of livestock.

MOTION: To approve letter to the Arizona Congressional Delegation. Steve Clark moved and Jim O'Haco seconded.

VOTE: Unanimous

8. Staff Presentation / Discussion

The Board reviewed and discussed to approve Draft Legislation.

Question: Director Voyles: Could the Board could request U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service match that money with federal funds? Kevin Kinsall: Yes.

MOTION: To approve Draft Legislation. Steve Clark moved and Jim O'Haco seconded.

VOTE: Unanimous

9. Staff Presentation / Discussion

The Board reviewed and discussed to approve letter to Attorney General requesting a formal opinion on the applicability of the Fifth Amendment of the U.S. Constitution to wolf depredation of livestock.

Question: Is it appropriate to ask for a reply date? Jim O: A particular date may not be honored. Question: Would it be appropriate to ask advice when an opinion would be rendered? Jim O.: Yes, that would be appropriate.

MOTION: To approve letter to Attorney General. Mark Killian moved and Jim Unmacht seconded.

MOTION amended to ask the Attorney General when we can expect a response.

VOTE: Unanimous

10. Staff Presentation / Discussion

The Board reviewed and discussed to adopt letter to Governor to request a rulemaking moratorium exception to authorize rulemaking.

MOTION: To approve letter to the Governor. Jim O'Haco moved and Ken Van de Graaff seconded.

VOTE: Unanimous

11. Staff Presentation / Discussion

The Board reviewed and discussed on letter of agreement with the National Fish and Wildlife Foundation for the purpose of adding this board to the Agreement.

MOTION: To approve letter of agreement to National Fish and Wildlife Foundation. Steve Clark moved and Jim O'Haco seconded.

VOTE: Unanimous

12. Discussion and Possible Action to Elect New Chairman

The Board discussed electing a new Chairman for 2017.

MOTION: To approve Ken Van de Graaf as the new Chairman to the Arizona Livestock Loss Board. Mark Killian moved and Jim O'Haco seconded.

VOTE: Unanimous

MOTION: BOARD WILL NOT GO INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION. Mark Killian moved and Ken Van de Graaff seconded.

VOTE: Unanimous

MOTION: MEETING TO ADJOURN. Mark Killian moved and Ken Van de Graaff seconded.

VOTE: Unanimous

Chairman Voyles adjourned the meeting at **3:15 p.m.**

I attest that these minutes were reviewed and approved by the members of the
Livestock Loss Board on May 31, 2017.



Ken Van De Graaff, Chairman